

7419

AN ASSESSMENT OF SLOW CITIES AS SUSTAINABLE TOURISM TOOLS IN THE CONTEXT OF HISTORICAL URBAN LANDSCAPE APPROACH: CASES IN TURKEY

Aysun Tuna

Assistant Professor

Faculty of Fine Arts and Design, Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University,
Battalgazi, Malatya, Türkiye
aysun.tuna@inonu.edu.tr

Hulisi Binbasioglu

Assistant Professor

Department of Tourism and Hotel Management, Malatya Turgut Özal University
Kale, Malatya, Türkiye
hulusi.binbasioglu@ozal.edu.tr

Bilge Hatun Ay

Graduate Student

Faculty of Fine Arts and Design, Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University,
Battalgazi, Malatya, Türkiye
bilgehatunay01@gmail.com

Abstract

Historical urban landscapes encompass the social and cultural practices of the built environment and the communities that interact with them, as well as the values and meanings community attached to the built environment. In this context, historical urban landscapes are the sources of information that have been shaped and developed by the societies with the tangible and intangible characteristics that extend to today. Now, these sources of information are at risk in terms of concepts such as rapid urbanization and industrialization. This issue necessitates the development of strategies for the preservation of historic urban landscapes. Cittaslow movement is nowadays on the agenda of the world as an alternative to the negative effects of rapidly operating cities, where people live in a very fast pace, and consume more than they produce as a result of the globalization. The purpose of Cittaslow basically offers an alternative and quality lifestyle to the communities by resisting the loss of identity in the cities the post-globalization era where uncontrolled growth, uniformity of the lifestyle of the society and the loss of cultural values and the resulting unidentified identity. Therefore, the Cittaslow has the similar aims with the sustainable tourism approach that is based on the approach of protecting and developing natural and cultural landscape resource values of the region where it exists economically, ecologically and environment-friendly. In this paper, the tools and action plans outlined in the UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach recommendation are examined and the 14 residential sites participating in the Cittaslow network will be studied. Qualitative analysis method will be employed in this study. Practices made on the basis of data received from the relevant local administrations of Cittaslow will be examined in the context of historic urban landscape approach tools. Present situations have been primarily stated to carry out the Cittaslow criteria in the settlements involved in the union of Cittaslow in Turkey in this paper.

After membership, the projects developed by local administrations within the scope of Cittaslow movement, have been evaluated in the intersection of sustainable tourism and historical urban landscape, and the influences of the implementations on Cittaslow have been set forth.

Keywords: sustainable tourism, historical urban landscape, Cittaslow

Introduction

Slow city movement started in 1986 at the opening of McDonald's, held at Spanish Stairs in Rome, to make a protest by throwing plates of Italian macaroni by the group led by the gastronomy journalist Carlo Petrini with the notion that "city square aesthetics would be damaged and eating is not feeding with junk food". Following the establishment of "Slow Food Guild" in the Barolo City of Italy, the Guild had attained an international characteristic in Paris in 1989 (Karadeniz, 2014; Üzümcü et al, 2016). This counteraction, shaped spontaneously and called as "slow food", has spread gradually and become a movement fed by a common slowness cognizance, not only in food but also in living, travelling, education, reading, money and other fields during the following years. This movement was developed as a "slow city movement" and gained an institutional identity. According to the Cittaslow International Charter (2009), Cittaslows are "*non-profit entities and their objectives are to promote and spread the culture of good living through research, testing and application of solutions for the city organization*". Cittaslow Charter provides suggestions to reduce many negative effects of globalization including monotony and standardization by popularizing the sustainable development principles in cities. Nilssoni et al., (2011) express the purpose of the Cittaslow charter as both improving life quality of city dwellers and creating guest- friendly cities and protecting and improving cultural heredity, architecture and traditions. Mayer & Knox (2006) define the slow city as an alternative urban development cognizance and positioned it against the main movement urban development cognizance. Radstrom (2011) emphasizes that the slowness concept corresponds to better life quality, transcending from slow movement. On the other hand, Honore (2008) states that slowness does not mean quiescence or provinciality but, on the contrary, it means protecting the traditions and adapting the good sides of the modern world to the end.

The framework of the code consists of the establishment and organs of Cittaslow Charter and the structure of these organs and the terms to be fulfilled by member cities to become a member of the Charter. These terms, called as Cittaslow criteria, are a list specifying plans, projects, organizations and programs that need to be attained by a city to become a member of Cittaslow Charter. These criteria are described in sub-articles under the main headings of energy and environmental policies, infrastructural policies, quality of urban quality policies, agricultural and touristic and artisan policies, social cohesion and partnership (Table 1). The requirement for the city population to be less than 50 thousand has been emphasized in the membership process (Keskin, 2012).

The criteria, to be fulfilled to become a member of "slow city" and included in Table 1, will prompt the existing tourism potential of a region as well as ensure sustainability of tourism activities by promoting the protection of its existing tourism potential. Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC) forms 32 sustainability criteria under four main headings to achieve sustainability in the tourism sector and designate the social responsibility of the sector, its environmental interactions and negative and positive economic and cultural effects. These criteria are listed under four headings, namely policies of sustainable administration systems, policies of socio-economic effects, policies of cultural interaction, and policies of environmental interaction (Global Sustainable Tourism Council, 2018). Güneş et al. (2015) describe the

common relations between the criteria of sustainable tourism and being a slow city by using the quantitative design method in their study. They conclude the results of their study that the sustainable tourism criteria and slow city criteria are parallel to each other and environmental and social policies have common characteristics.

Historical Urban Landscape Approach

The requirement for adapting some factors is prominent in the sustainable protection of historical landscapes including the interaction between natural and structured environments, historical cities to become the subject of new developments due to the layering of old and new city dynamics, popularization of modern architecture in historical sites and development of awareness for this, considering that change of economy and city roles occurs through micro and macro scale tourism strategies, the concepts of specificity and completeness to become prominent for the protection of living historical landscapes, use of the buffer zone concept as a protection strategy, and moral values (Tuna, 2016). The historical city landscape recommendation of UNESCO, suggesting the development of the practice of a new city heredity protection that is able to cope with today's globalization dynamics, was approved by the UNESCO General Assembly on 10/11/2011 (UNESCO,2011).

The recommendation submits a landscape approach, considering the relations between physical forms, spatial organizations and connections, natural features and positions and social, cultural and economic values within a larger city concept to designate, protect and manage historical areas. This approach consists of the issues of policy, administration and management where various partners participate, including local, national, regional, international, public and private actors in the city development process and develop the approach of "holistic urban protection" (UNESCO, 2011). The recommendation defines historical city landscape instruments and action plans for accomplishing these criteria and integrating them with the approach of city heredity protection (Table 2). These instruments have been set as civic participation, informing and planning and regulating systems and financial instruments. The instruments aim to achieve spatial and temporal sustainability of the settlement identity, which is a part of city heredity. These instruments can be defined as elements, which shape protection codes by directing the interventions and achieving employment by encouraging participation for the protection of society and hence, contributing to the regional economy and which need to be integrated into city planning (Tuna, 2016b).

It is seen that the criteria, which are necessary to be a slow city, are parallel to each other by comparing the Cittaslow criteria and historical city landscape approach. Cittaslow movement, based on the main target of achieving sustainability of local identity, denotes activation of historical city landscape instruments, which are necessary to protect cultural heredity and integrate it into the city planning process. In this context, it can be concluded that a settlement, included in Cittaslow charter and have the title of slow city, has fulfilled the main criteria defined in UNESCO's recommendation and has committed to fulfill them.

It is crucial for the destinations to carry their tourism activities with sustainable development principles in cities. The aim of this study to research the Cittaslows in Turkey if they meet the criteria of UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach in the context of sustainable tourism. There are many studies about both sustainable tourism and Cittaslow. But there is no research studying Cittaslows with meeting the criteria of UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach. Because it is the first study to investigate the Cittaslows in Turkey in the frame of UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach, it is thought that this study will contribute to the literature.

Table 1: The Cittaslow Membership Process Criteria

ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENTAL POLICIES	<p>Air quality conservation*</p> <p>Water quality conservation*</p> <p>Drinking water consumption of residents</p> <p>Urban solid separate waste collection*</p> <p>Industrial and domestic composting</p> <p>Purification of sewage disposal*</p> <p>Energy saving in buildings and public systems</p> <p>Public energy production from renewable sources</p> <p>Reduction of visual pollution, traffic noise</p> <p>Reduction of public light pollution*</p> <p>Electrical energy consumption of resident families</p> <p>Conservation of biodiversity</p>	AGRICULTURAL, TURISTIC AND ARTISAN POLICIES	<p>Development of agro-ecology**</p> <p>Protection of handmade and labelled artisan production (certified, museums of culture, etc.)*</p> <p>Increasing the value of working techniques and traditional crafts*</p> <p>Increasing the value of rural areas (greater accessibility to resident services)*</p> <p>Use of local products, if possible organic, in communal public restaurants (school canteens, etc.)*</p> <p>Education of flavors and promoting the use of local products, if possible organic in the catering industry and private consumption*</p> <p>Conservation and increasing the value of local cultural events*</p> <p>Additional hotel capacity (beds/residents per year)*</p> <p>Prohibiting the use of GMO in agriculture</p> <p>New ideas for enforcing plans concerning land settlements previously used for agriculture</p>
INFRASTRUCTURAL POLICIES	<p>Efficient cycle paths connected to public buildings</p> <p>Length (in kms) of the urban cycle paths created over the total of kms of urban roads*</p> <p>Bicycle parking in interchange zones</p> <p>Planning of eco-mobility as an alternative to private cars*</p> <p>Removal of architectural barriers*</p> <p>Initiatives for family life and pregnant women*</p> <p>Verified accessibility to medical services</p> <p>“Sustainable” distribution of merchandise in urban centers</p> <p>Percentage of residents that commutes daily to work in another town*</p>	POLICIES FOR HOSPITALITY, AWARENESS AND TRAINING	<p>Good welcome (training of people in charge, signs, suitable infrastructure and hours)*</p> <p>Increasing awareness of operators and traders (transparency of offers and practiced prices, clear visibility of tariffs)*</p> <p>Availability of “slow” itineraries (printed, web, etc.)</p> <p>Adoption of active techniques suitable for launching bottom-up processes in the more important administrative decisions</p> <p>Permanent training of trainers and /or administrators and employees on Cittaslow slow themes**</p> <p>Health education (battle against obesity, diabetes, etc.)</p> <p>Systematic and permanence information for the citizens regarding the meaning of Cittaslow (even pre-emptively on adherence)*</p> <p>The active presence of associations operating with the administration on Cittaslow themes</p> <p>Support for Cittaslow campaigns*</p> <p>Insertion/use of the Cittaslow logo on headed paper and website*</p>
QUALITY OF URBAN LIFE	<p>Planning for urban resilience**</p> <p>Interventions of recovery and increasing the value of civic centers (street furniture, tourist signs, aeriels, urban landscape mitigation conservation*</p> <p>Recovery/creation of social green areas with productive plants and/or fruit trees**</p> <p>Urban livableness (“house-work, nursery, company hours, etc.”)</p> <p>Requalification and reuse of marginal areas*</p> <p>Use of ICT in the development of interactive services for citizens and tourists*</p>	SOCIAL COHESION	<p>Minorities discriminated</p> <p>Enclave / neighbors</p> <p>Integration of disable people</p> <p>Children care</p> <p>Youth condition</p> <p>Poverty</p> <p>Community association</p> <p>Multicultural integration</p> <p>Political participation</p> <p>Public housing</p> <p>The existence of youth activity areas, and a youth center</p>

Service desk for sustainable architecture (bio-architecture, etc.)*
 Cable network city (fiber optics, wireless)*
 Monitoring and reduction of pollutants (noise, electrical systems, etc.)*
 Development of telecommuting
 Promotion of private sustainable urban planning (passivhouse, mater.construction, etc.)
 Promotion of social infrastructure (time-based currency, freecycling projects, etc.)
 Promotion of public sustainable urban planning (passivhouse, mater. construction, etc.)*
 Recovery/creation of productive green areas with productive plants and/ or of fruit within the urban perimeter**
 Creation of spaces for the commercialization of local products*
 Protection /increasing value of workshops-creation of natural shopping centers*
 Meter cubes of cement (net infrastructures) in green urban areas

PARTNERSHIPS

Support for Cittaslow campaigns and activity
 Collaboration with other organizations promoting natural and traditional food
 Support for twinning projects and cooperation for the development of developing countries covering also the spread philosophies of Cittaslow

*= Obligatory requirement
 **= Perspective requirements

Source: Cittaslow International Charter (2017) Retrieved from <http://www.cittaslow.org> p.25-27.

Table 2: Historical Urban Landscape (HUL) toolkits

HUL Approach Toolkits			
Civic Engagement Tools	Knowledge and Planning Tools	Regulatory Systems	Financial Tools
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accessible, multiplatform urban planning vision process - Public forums about aspects of the urban future - Web-based local heritage games - Urban heritage issues web exchange blogs, chat rooms - Planning charrettes with open dialogue - Documentation projects, oral interviews, videos - Community heritage stewardship skill development, workshops, projects - Volunteer efforts to sustain local historic places 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The holistic planning process that incorporates urban heritage & values - Documentation of tangible & intangible community heritage - Urban viewscape mapping for building envelope, height, location - Planning for the conservation of natural & cultural resources - Targeted urban preservation, management, tourism plans - Green infrastructure knowledge applied with heritage considered - Plans incorporating heritage values to address streets, public facilities, storm-water, parks, etc. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Zoning ordinance underpinned by urban heritage database - Conservation easement law - Historic district commission law - Traditional, customary systems, indigenous peoples - Legislated climate change targets - Tree protection ordinance - Green Infrastructure, Renewable Energy Codes - Multi-purpose overlay districts, for the economy, heritage, aesthetics, conservation - The legislation specifically addressing urban heritage stewardship/management - Urban viewscape controls 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Private Public Partnership targeted funding for Urban Heritage - Public Capital Improvements - Ongoing Public Maintenance Staffing & Budgets - Private Building & Property Maintenance - Purchase Y Resale with Conservation Restrictions - Revolving Loan Fund addressing Historic Structures - Long-Term Lease of Heritage Properties - Mutual Covenants - Outright Purchase of Key Properties - Conservation Easements - Transfer of Development Rights - Donations of Heritage Property to Reliable Stewards - Funding for Urban Heritage Conservation Agencies - Grant Programs for Urban Intangible and Tangible Heritage Actions - Taxation Laws Favoring Preservation Investments

Source: O'Donnel & Turner (2016) The Historic Urban Recommendation: A New UNESCO Tool for Sustainable Future, IFLA Cape Town, Retrieved from <http://www.heritagelandscape.com>

Material and Method

The qualitative research method was selected in this paper not to consider the selected subject as separate from human and the process and to facilitate access to information. Multiple case study was applied for choosing the slow cities. The data was collected by face-to-face and email environment interviews with local administration representatives. A literature search was conducted during the study and brochures, CDs, catalogues, articles, books, thesis and projects on the subject were reviewed and the necessary information was collected. Furthermore, a detailed internet search was performed to access up-to-date information.

There are 236 Cittaslows in 30 countries in the world and 15 of the Cittaslows are in Turkey. The Slow City Movement in Turkey started on November 28, 2009, when Seferihisar of Izmir City was included in Slow City charter as the first city of Turkey and the 129th city of the world. As a result of the studies conducted to popularize this movement in Turkey, Taraklı (Sakarya), Gökçeada (Çanakkale), Yenipazar (Aydın), Yalvaç (Isparta), and Akyaka (Muğla) have earned the title of slow city in 2011, Vize (Kırklareli) and Perşembe (Ordu) in 2012, Halfeti (Şanlıurfa) in 2013, Şavşat (Artvin) in 2015, Uzundere (Erzurum), Eğirdir (Isparta), Göynük (Bolu), and Gerze (Sinop) in 2017, and Mudurnu (Bolu) in 2018 (Cittaslow Türkiye, 2018). Because Mudurnu has just earned this title, it could not be possible to collect data from this Cittaslow. So, in the current paper, there are 14 Cittaslows to study.

Results

Natural and cultural landscape resource values of the mentioned slow cities in Turkey, activities conducted in the area, local gastronomy, local economic resources and projects performed by the local administrations during and after the Cittaslow membership process are outlined in Table 3. The data shown in Table 3 were collected by interviews held with the authorized technical team of local administrations involved in the follow up of the process.

Table 3: Natural and cultural landscape resources of slow cities and projects performed by the local administrations

	Natural and cultural landscape resource	Local gastronomy and festivals	Local economic resources	Projects performed by the local administrations
SEFERİHİSAR	Beaches (in West, Azmak, KüçükAkkum, BüyükAkkum, Akarca, Ekmeksiz, Bahadır, Çiftkalesi; in South, PayamlıDoğanbey, İpekkum and Ürkmez), Thermal-thermaes (Doğanbey, Tuzla, Karakoç, Cumalı, Uyuz, Ahmetçi, Gelinboğan, Hamamönü), Wetlands (Azmak), Agricultural lands (Ulaş-Düzce-Seferihisar plains, Doğanbey-Payamlı-Ürkmez plains), Forested lands (forested areas around Gödence, Beyler, and small forest area in Teos), Rivers and dams (major rivers such as Ulaş creek, Yassıçay, Karakoç, and Seferihisar, Kavakdere, Ürkmez dams). Ancient settlements (Teos, Herakleia, Lebedos, Myonnesos), the Seljuk and Ottoman settlements (Karaköse, Sığacık Castle, Seferihisar), Historical Turkish baths-"Hamam" in Turkish (Büyükhamam, Küçükhamam, Ulaşhamam, Düzcehamam, SığacıkKaleiçiHamam), Mosque and madrasahs (Hereke Mosque, KasımÇelebi Madrasah and Social Complex, Ulaş Mosque, Gündük Minaret Mosque, Hıdırlık Mosque, Turabiye Mosque, Ulu(Great) Mosque, Sığacık Mosque), Water aqueduct (seven girls aqueduct) Tumuli (Güneşlikent tumulus, Hıdırlık Tumuli)	Sıyırma dessert Tarhana Yuvalaça Ekmekdolması, Mandarin dessert EnginarDolması Samsades dessert Nohutlu Manti Traditional Armola seed swap festival, Mandarin festival, SeferihisarlılaExhibiton	Agricultural products and village bazaar (Armola goat cheese, satsuma mandarin, Alfons type of grape, house wine, olive oil Fishery eco-tourism, <u>coastal</u> tourism	Women's Cooperative Seferipazar.com Seed bank project Sustainable Fishery Project (AB) Vegetable gardens at schools Sığacık Landscape Project (İZKA - İzmir Development Agent) Atatürk Avenue Improvement Study Children-Friendly Seferihisar Project (UNICEF) Ecological Branding in Tourism (İZKA) Blue Flag Projects Project of Monumental Olive Trees Project of Home for Street Animals Children's Municipality Project Nature School Project Dutlaraltı Square Project Young Bank Project Project of Women's Labor Centers Beach soccer field project Teos wetland dune support project Project of Fairytale Centers Project of treatment plant establishment Project of wise tree olive oil production Tangerine jam – canned artichoke project (İZKA) Street luminaries with solar energy Carbon emission estimation Compost facility Construction of solar energy plant

TARAKLI

<p>Karagöl Plateau, Güngörmez Waterfall, ÇilePınarı, monument sycamore, HacıyakupPaşalar Village, YunusPaşa Mosque, Taraklı Houses, historical bath,Taraklı streets, Küçükhan, Çakırlar, Orhangazi Bazaar, Hark Canyon and Cave, fortress, water mill.</p>	<p>Keşkek YaprakDolması EtliNohut-Köpük Halva Camping and Caravanser Festival, Nature-culture and handcrafts festival, Hıdırlıkpilav festival</p>	<p>culture tourism, Thermal tourism, tableland tourism, speleological tourism, paragliding tourism Vegetable-fruit growing, Manufacture and sale of traditional handicraft products such as scalloped cloths and wooden spoons, boxed combs</p>	<p>Taraklı Thermal Touristic Springs Producer markets Restoration of traditional houses and commercial building City square landscape project,</p>
--	--	---	--

GÖKÇEADA

<p>Beaches; Aydıncık, Gizli Liman, Kuzuliman,LazKoyu, Marmaros, MaviKoy, YıldızKoy, Yuvalı, Lakes:TuzGölü, Kaşkaval, Waterfall: Marmaros, Villages: Şahinkaya, Dereköy, Eşelek, Şirinköy, EskiBademli, Kaleköy, Tepeköy, Uğurlu, YeniBademli, Zeytinli, Historical places: Mosques:Central Mosque, historical laundry, İskitler castle,, rock tombs, churches and monasteries: Church of AyaPanayia, Metropolitan, Aya Varvara, AyaMarina, AgiosGeorgios, EvangelismosTeotoku, HagiaMarina,KoimesisTisTh eotokos, YeniBademli Mound</p>	<p>Seafood dishes, kuzukapama 15 August Mary's main festival Gökçeada motorcycle festival Gökçeadaot festival Gökçeadaishaish open cup festival Easter holiday Gökçeada Gastronomy and Agriculture Festival</p>	<p>Trekking, diving, windsurfing tourism Viniculture, Vegetable-fruit growing, bee culture, honey production, coastal tourism, fishery</p>	<p>Slow Food Convivium Gökçeada Gastronomy Research Center Organic Agriculture Project Earth Market within the scope of CittaslowGökçeada Earth Market Project Valentina Hiking Trail Kaleköy Landscape Work</p>
---	--	--	--

AKYAKA

<p>Gökova Valley, Sedir Island, Cleopatra beach, Idyia Ancient City, Hüsametlin Efendi Mosque Yeni Mosque, Agalar Mosque, Gölova-Akyaka, traditional houses</p>	<p>UlaKebab, seafood and olive oil dishes, yaprakciğer, EkşiliTavuk Ula Culture and Art Festival Garlic and Cherry Festival Bullfighting events</p>	<p>Organic bazaar, tobacco, cereals, sesame growing, poultry farming, Vegetable-fruit growing, Kitesurfing, windsurfing, sea canyon, bike tours, rock climbing, river canopy, paragliding, sailing, canyon pass, horse riding, fishing, bird atlas work, bird watching tourism</p>	<p>Project of surf tourism, Geyik Canyon Project, protection Project for Gökova Gulf, eucalyptus road Project, Kanunui road Project, arrangement projects for disabled, Karia walking road project</p>
---	--	--	--

YENİPAZAR

<p>Yörük Ali Efe Museum, Beyler Tower, Donduran Castle, AlhanHamam, Aşağı Dip Natura Park, Çamlık Recreation Area, historic windmill</p>	<p>EkmekDolması YenipazarPidesi Et Lelegisi Hurma(Yuvarlama) KarnabaharMücveri, Keşkek YavruKavurması</p> <p>Traditional KaraçakalYörükleri Culture and Promotion Festival Traditional Camel Wrestling Cycling Festival Spring Festival</p>	<p>Organic bazaars, bee culture, ginnery, olive oil fabric, Vegetable-fruit growing (cotton, corn, wheat, olives), production of traditional folk arts such as folk dolls, iğneoyası Ottoman telkırma, mountaineering, trekking, paragliding, bird watching</p>	<p>Municipality Energy Saving Project by using alternative energy resources (renewable resources, green hydrogen, mini-hydroelectric energy plant) and producing renewable resources and heat from biomasses. Solar furnace project Natural Products Market Project “sospesopiantare” project “Women’s Environment Culture and Operation Cooperative Seed trade project “Student Gardens” project Aşağıdip Lake Nature Orthosia Cultural Center “Aşağı Dip Lake Natural Park” project preparations are ongoing</p>
--	---	---	--

YALVAÇ

<p>Hoyran Lake, Ayiini Cave, Çınaraltı Devlethan Mosque, Psidia Ancient City, House of Tıraşzade, House of Keçe, Leather Industry Open Air Museum, Mustafa Bilgin Art House, Traditional Dining House, Yalvaç Museum, rock toms, Ay Tanrısı Men sanctuary, Ottoman Hamam,</p>	<p>“YalvaçPsidiaAntiokheia Culture Tourism and Art Festival Hıdırellez festivals Bike Races</p>	<p>Precious handicrafts - Ironmongery Semercilik Leather Saddlery Embroidering Horse car construction Yalvaç bazaar</p>	<p>Solar energy plant project Clear Yalvaç Project Skateboard park project Urban Transformation Projects Park Municipality Square Landscape project</p>
---	---	---	---

VİZE

<p>Kacakoçak hill, Çiftekaynakalar, Asmakayalar Cave, Yenesu Cave, Kiyıköy, Cehennem Waterfall, GaziSüleymanPaşa Mosque (LittelAyasofya), Serbetdar Hasan bey Mosque, Vize Castle and rampart, Ancient theater, FerhatBeyHamam and fountain, Asmakayalar monastery</p>	<p>Linden honey Vize cheese, oğlakçevirme, kiremittemantarlıalabalık, stinging nettle soup Thrace gastronomy festival</p>	<p>Vegetable-fruit growing (Wheat, sunflower, sugar beet, corn, legumes, onion), bee culture, fishery, Diving, kite surf, paragliding tourism</p>	<p>Wind plant project for clean energy production Street Development Project in collaboration with Thrace Development Agency Cultural Heredity for Cross-Border Harmony and Prospect Project of Improvement of Vize Country Waste Management Infrastructure Bicycle” Project To borderless Equality – Youth Camp Project Improvement of Haliçi Region by accomplishing “Local Project” of Vize’s Attraction Center Cross-Border Youth Cultural Center</p>
--	---	---	---

PERŞEMBE

<p>Koçboynuzu (Kral) path Hoynat Island, Medreseönü Afırlı Mosque, YasonburnuFeneri, Çaka, Aktaş, Efırlı Beach, Çamburnu, Çeşmeönü, Kışlaönü, Mersin Villages, Şenyurt waterfall, Babalı rock tombs, Belicesu, Büyükağız</p>	<p>Hamsilipilav, melocankavurması, jonycake, ret beet soup and sarma, sakarcakayganası, Galdirikkevurması, pickle Perşembe spring festival</p>	<p>Fishery, Diving, kite surf, paragliding tourism Vegetable-fruit growing (hazelnut, kiwi, strawberry)</p>	<p>Establishment of the Sewage Treatment Facility Ivy geranium distribution to all porches located at seaside and poles located at central refuge Building approximately 10 km of bicycle track from OrduKumbaşı District till PerşembeKaleyaka District Building birdwatching places at Hoynat Island bird heaven and rearrangement of Koçboynuzu (Kral) path as a hiking trail in collaboration with the Nature Association Street Development Project and Perşembe City Square Project Organic market</p>
--	--	---	--

HALFETİ	Birecik Dam, Rumkale, Barşavma Monastery, Gürkuyu Church, House of Kanterma Mezrası, Aziz Nerses Church, Birdhouse constructed with traditional cut stone	sablefish kebab, eggplant tomato onion fig kebab çağırtlak kebab dolma eziği, plum tava, mukaşerli pilav, sargıburma tatlısı, semsek, cheese halva	Cattle-raising, sheep and goat breeding viniculture, Olive cultivation Peanut breeding, cereal planting, Boating tourism	Organic market Halfeti city park District sports fields Halfeti Pier and Marina project Project of electric production from garbage
		Fruit Food Festival Fragrance Festival Black Rose Festival		
ŞAŞAT	Villages: Maden, Tepeköy, Otluca, Yavuzköy, Karagöl, Veli, Plateau: Sahara, Arşıyan, Arşıyan lake, Suatan waterfall, Cevizli monastery, Şavşat castle, Sattle Church and cemetery, Tamara rooms, VeliKöy Wood Mosque, Tepeköy Traditional Life Cultural Museum Meydancık stone arch bridge, Yavuzköy viewing platform	Haşuta,kaysefezurfiyet, sinor, kuymak, gendima, şılay, pekmez, cheese eritme, iron dessert, pickles Sahara Culture and Art Festival ŞavşatYavuzköy Winter festivals ŞavşatVeliköy snow wrestling festival MeydancıkSateve festival KarüstüKarakucak wrestling festival Marioba festival Çavdarlı village Saparkule festival	Cattle-raising, sheep and goat breeding, Bee culture, Vegetable-fruit growing (potato, pear, apple, quince, plum, cherry, cranberry and walnut) local product bazaar local woodworking hydro-tourism and thermal tourism, tableland tourism	Project of building vegetable, fruit and plant desiccation machinery with solar energy in the county Local product market Tepeköy Traditional Life Cultural Museum Life Campus solid waste association studies Children's Municipality project Clear Living Center Animal shelter studies Women's living center Domestic seed bank Honeysuckle Center Project of Making Shop Signs Adaptable to the vernacular architecture
UZUNDERE	Tortum waterfall, Yedigöller, Uzundere, Çağlayan Cave, Chimney Rock, (peribacaları) Öşk monastery, Sapanca (Eşkisor) castle, Engüzel castle, İnçer Mosque	Tandır bread DAP-Young-Festival, Traditional Karakucak Wrestling Bird Watch Festival East Anatolian Youth Festival	Vegetable-fruit growing (Barley, Wheat, Onions, Potatoes, Corn, Clover and Sauce) trout farming, bee culture, greenhouse, forestry, rafting,	Uzundere Boutique Hotel and Welcoming Center Project Project of Supporting Yıkıklar Natural Environment Protection and Process of Joining of Çoruh Valley to Eurovelo European Bicycle Network Project of European Tourism Indicators of Sustainable Management (ETIS) at Destination Uzundere tourism master plan 2023
EĞİRDİR	Eğirdir lake, Eğirdir castle, Eğirdir Caravanserai, Green Island, Kovada Lake Nature Park, Altinkum beach, Bedre village, Prostanna Ancient City, Dünyabeyhammam and madrasah	A kitchen where apple is used in different dishes Triathlon races Bridge tournaments, Classical Music Festival, Moral Festival Motorcycle and Bicycle Festivals Classical Music Festival Optimist Races for Children	Handmade products Cattle-raising, sheep and goat breeding, Forest product, apple product, carpet weaving, tableland tourism, hunting, water sports tourism, fishery	Cittaslow Local Market Project of city tour with a parachute Recycling projects Village bazar to sell village products of Pınar Bazar street fair Cittaslow square Nostalgic train study Smart water meter construction Handmade products sale shop Stamp construction with Cittaslow logo Study of bicycle track construction along the seaside Prize Sirkeci project Eğirdir market project

GÖYNÜK

Çubuk lake,
Sünnet lake,
Şarlahan waterfall and
canyon,
Akşemseddin shrine,
Zaferturm,
BıçakçıÖmerDede shrine,
GaziSüleymanPaşa Mosque
and hammam,
DebbağDede shrine,
Gürcüler City museum

Tarhana, Erişte, ,
Düğün Soup,
Keş (Kesik), Güveç,
kuzu doldurma,
Oklava dessert
baklava, hoşmerim,
Potato, aubergine,
curd, cheese, squash,
spinach,
mancourished,
precious pide

Cittaslow Turkey
Festival

Religious tourism,
Thermal tourism,
poultry farming,
fixingCattle-raising,
sheep and goat
breeding,
Bee culture,
forestry

GaziSüleyman Pasha Boulevard arbor,
greening and landscape studies (3 parks,
namely Akşemseddin, Çeşme and Kepkebir
parks and children playgrounds have been
renewed).
Historical Çınaraltı tea garden environmental
planning and construction of new fishery and
produce shops at Municipality Square
Göynük Municipality Local Handcraft
Education Center
Digital City Development Plan and Smart City
Management System, CBS and city
surveillance camera system
Putting healthy living club into service
Historical Hz. Akşemseddin Mosque
restoration and historical SofualiMosque
restoration
Restoration of the existing 'village products
bazar' building according to the county
architecture

GERZE

Yelken hill, Sorku waterfall,
Sökü plateau, Değirmenli
waterfall, Dereçuma
mosque, the house of
Yakupağa, Çeçe Sultan
shrine, İskele mosque,
Stonehouse, Köşk mound,
Tümüleinecropol,
lighthouse

Kaşıkhamuru,
nokul, saltfish,
Nuri DedeSimidi,
Zıbıdık, Kulak hamuru
with meat,
Kazıyak,düğün halvah

July 18-20 Gerze
Festival
International
children's theater
festival
Culture and art
festival
Grease Wrestling
Festival
Children's Festival
and Traditional Kite
Festival

Organic bazaars,
tableland tourism,
woodenworks (toys,
shipbuilding,
carving), the art of
tile-making, nature
tourism

Ecological agricultural product bazar
Project of sign transformation according to
the traditional architecture
City design directory project
Project of old historical monument
protection cultural center opening
Cultural Center Project
Disabled People Friendly Say Beach (renewed
temporarily)
Recycling projects
Project of clear living parks
Illumination of Gerze Ecologic Village Parks
with Solar Energy
City Design Project
Gürleyik Creek Route Pedestrian and Bicycle
Track Landscape Project
Coastal Road Project
Dereyeri and AlaattinŞahin Avenue Beach
Building Design Project

As seen in Table 4, the activities performed by local administrations in slow cities that joined the Cittaslow Charter during and after the Cittaslow membership process are assessed according to the tools determined by UNESCO in the historical city landscape approach.

Table 4: Comparison of slow cities according to the tools determined by UNESCO in the historical city landscape approach.

		Slow Cities in Turkey													
The tools determined by UNESCO		SEFERİHISAR	TARAKLI	GÖKÇEADA	AKYAKA	YENİPAZAR	YALVAÇ	VİZE	PERŞEMBE	HALFETİ	ŞAVŞAT	UZUNDERE	EĞİRDİR	GÖYNÜK	GERZE
Civic Engagement Tools	Accessible, multiplatform urban planning vision process	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	-
	Public forums about aspects of the urban future	+	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
	Web based local heritage games	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Urban heritage issues web exchange blogs, chat rooms	+	-	+	+	+	-	-	+	-	-	-	+	+	-
Civic Engagement Tools	Planning charrettes with open dialogue	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
	Documentation projects, oral interviews, videos	+	-	+	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	-	+	+	-
	Volunteer efforts to sustain local historic places	+	-	+	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	-	+	+	-
	Community heritage stewardship skill development, workshops, projects	+	-	+	-	-	-	+	+	+	-	-	+	+	-
Knowledge and Planning Tools	Holistic planning process that incorporates urban heritage & values	+	+	+	-	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	-
	Documentation of tangible & intangible community heritage	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	-	+	+
	Urban viewscape mapping for building envelope, height, location	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
	Planning for conservation of natural & cultural resources	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
	Targeted urban preservation, management, tourism plans	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	+	+	+	-
	Green infrastructure knowledge applied with heritage considered	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	+	-	+	-
	Plans incorporating heritage values to address streets, public facilities, storm-water, parks, etc.	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
Regulatory Systems	Zoning ordinance underpinned by urban heritage database	+	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-
	Conservation development plan	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	+	+	+	-
	Traditional, customary systems, indigenous peoples	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	-
	Legislated climate change targets	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Tree protection ordinance	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Green Infrastructure, Renewable Energy Codes	+	-	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	-
	Multi-purpose overlay districts, for economy, heritage, aesthetics, conservation	+	-	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	-	+	+	-
Financial Tools	Legislation specifically addressing urban heritage stewardship/management	+	+	+	-	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	-
	Urban viewscape controls	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	-	-	-	+	-
	Private Public Partnership targeted funding for Urban Heritage	+	+	+	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	+	-	+	-
	Public Capital Improvements	+	-	+	-	+	+	+	+	-	-	+	-	+	-
	Ongoing Public Maintenance Staffing & Budgets	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	-	+	+	-	+	+
	Private Building & Property Maintenance	+	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Revolving Loan Fund addressing Historic Structures	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	-	+	-	-	+	-
Financial Tools	Long-Term Lease of Heritage Properties	+	-	+	-	+	-	-	+	+	-	-	-	+	-
	Legal facilities in the protection actions	+	+	+	-	-	-	+	+	-	+	-	-	+	-

Donations of Heritage Property to Reliable Stewards	+	-	+	-	-	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
Funding for Urban Heritage Conservation Agencies	+	+	+	-	-	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	-
Grant Programs for Urban Intangible and Tangible Heritage Actions	+	-	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	-

Conclusions

Studies conducted at public spaces by local administrations in slow cities of Turkey can have multiple aspects encompassing various headings in the membership criteria. However, landscape design in public spaces may be assessed within more definitive limits in the framework of the target of the easy and convenient use of public spaces by city dwellers and achieving sustainable local progress and attaining good living quality. In this context, as a result of a general assessment based on the impressions obtained in field studies, the organizations of public spaces in slow cities in Turkey can be grouped in the lights of the membership criteria under the headings of, pedestrianizing /vehicle-free road, street improvement/development, square landscape design, park and sports field organization, providing areas for local producers/producer markets, cultural centers/city museum, alternative transportation roads (bicycle tracks, etc.), restored/transformed structures as open to public, studies conducted for the involvement of women and youngsters in public spaces, access of disabled people to public spaces, establishment of public communication areas through internet/ social media use, blue flag beaches for counties located by seaside (Yavuzçehre&Donat, 2017).

Considering the general assessment in addition to the city assessment, despite it is indicated that there are specific arrangements in any slow city, it is common knowledge that these arrangements occur in considerably different numbers and characteristics in slow cities. It is seen that relatively specific studies in locations have been conducted excluding Seferihisar in the framework of slow city criteria for improving sustainable local development and life quality.

Considering slow cities in the context of historical city landscape approach, it is seen that nearly all planning tools have been put into practice in Seferihisar slow city but, only a small part of them has been adopted in Gerze slow city. Considering the distribution of HLC toolkits in slow cities, knowledge and planning tools have been applied yet regulatory tools have not been applied adequately. This case can be explained by deficiencies in national protection policies or more substantial effect of defects in local scale. Among the tools proposed in the development of Historical Urban Landscape (HUL), while the applications made in Seferihisar and Gökçeada Cittaslows under the scope of Civic Engagement Tools stand out, it has been determined that the studies conducted in Gerze are generally insufficient. This situation is thought to be related to the year of obtaining the status of a Cittaslow.

It is seen that especially the conservation practices concentrated in slow cities of Seferihisar, Gökçeada, Yenipazar, Uzungöl, Perşembe and Göynük but Halfeti is behind. The lack of development plans for protection in the slow city of Halfeti is an important deficiency in planning studies aimed at preserving deficiencies in tourism master plans and infrastructure plans.

Regulatory systems tool within the frame of global climate change in all slow cities due to the risk analysis (erosion, carrying capacity, etc.) was not done and in this context, the protection regulations were not required to determine the legal regulations were determined. Within the scope of the green infrastructure system in slow cities, only the applications to benefit from solar energy have been determined.

//www.heritagelandscapes.com/Sitelimages/IFLA-Cape%20Town-HUL%20Donnell-Turner%2028July2012(1).pdf

Özmen, Y.Ş., Birsen, Ö., & Birsen, H., (2016) Kentleşme Dinamiklerine Cittaslow Kentler Üzerinden Bakmak: Türkiye'deki Cittaslow Şehirleri Üzerine Bir Araştırma, *Online Journal of the Faculty of Communication Sciences*, 24(2), 9-22.

Şahinkaya, S. (2010) Bir Yerel Kalkınma Modeli: Cittaslow ve Seferihisar Üzerine Değerlendirmeler, Retrieved from http://www.bagimsizsosyalbilimciler.org/Yazilar_Uye/SahinTem10.pdf

Radstrom, S. (2011) A Place-Sustaining Framework for Local Urban Identity: An Introduction and History of Cittaslow, *Italian Journal of Planning Practice*, 1(1), 90-113.

Tuna, A. (2016a) Explicating the Historical Landscape Approach According to Renovation Projects of Historical Environment in Turkey. In R. Efe, İ. Curebal, A. Gad & B. Toth (Eds.), *Environmental Sustainability and Landscape Management*, (pp. 274-291). Sofia: St. Kliment Ohridski University Press.

Tuna, A. (2016b) *Tarihi KentSEL Peyzaj Yaklaşımı Kapsamında İyi Uygulama Örnekleri (Best Practices in the context of Historical Urban Landscape Approach)*. Paper presented at the 6th Landscape Architecture Congress, Antalya, Türkiye.

Yavuzçehre, S.P., & Donat O. (2017) An Investigation on the effect of the Slow City (Cittaslow) Membership on Public Spaces in Turkey, *Pamukkale University Journal of Social Sciences Institute*, 27, 299-320, DOI: 10.5505/pausbed.2017.25901,

UNESCO (2011) Recommendation on the Historic Landscape, including a glossary definition, Retrieved from http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.phpURL_ID=48857&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

Üzümcü, P.T., Çelik, A., & Özkul, E. (2016) Sürdürülebilir Kırsal Kalkınma için Yavaş Şehir Anlayışı: Kandıra Örneği (Cittaslow Movement for Sustainable Rural Development: The Case of Kandıra), *International Journal of Social and Economic Sciences*, 6 (2), 41-51.

Biographical Notes

Aysun Tuna is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University, Battalgazi, Malatya, Türkiye where she teaches courses on the historical landscape and landscape design and application techniques. Her research focuses on the sustainable historical urban landscape.

Hulisi Binbasioglu is an Assistant Professor of the School of Kale Tourism and Hotel Management at Malatya Turgut Özal University in Turkey. He received his BSc in Tourism and Hotel Management at Anadolu University, Eskişehir, and MSc and PhD in Marketing from İnönü University, Malatya. His teaching and researches related to tourism, cultural heritage, mobile technology and social media.

Bilge Hatun Ay is a graduate student in the Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University, Battalgazi, Malatya.